Interactive comment on “Stable isotope and modelling evidence that CO$_2$ drives vegetation changes in the tropics” by F. J. Bragg et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 16 November 2012

The manuscript "Stable isotope and modelling evidence that CO2 drives vegetation changes in the tropics" is well written and I see no flaws in the use and interpretation of climate models. The conclusions are therefore justified and the manuscript in principal is ready for publication. The only concern I have is the presentation of pollen data which seem somewhat unnecessary as these data are not strong enough to base any conclusion on them. The authors rightly state that these data do not contradict their main finding from climate modelling but I feel that this is a debatable justification for including this data in this manuscript. I imagine that the manuscript will not suffer in strength but gain in conciseness if this part is omitted.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 9, 15699, 2012.

C5697