Horst Felbeck is correct to draw attention to the difficulties in interpreting the carbon fixation data due to oxaloacetate formation during hypoxia. However, provided that the oxygen concentration was above 50 micromolar (for Bathymodiolus azoricus), there should be no hypoxia effects in the presence of the sulphide concentrations used (up to 32 micromolar). Although individual mussels have their own frequency of valve opening and closing, in the presence of low sulphide concentrations they tend to remain open for all but a few minutes over a 24 h period. It would, of course, have been nice to have
video-observations of their behaviour over the experiment. It is unfortunate that all the specimens used in the January experiment were not analysed especially because of the differential symbiont loss in individuals.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 5, 2279, 2008.