

***Interactive comment on* “Biological soil crusts on initial soils: organic carbon dynamics and chemistry under temperate climatic conditions” by A. Dümig et al.**

**J.-A. Subke (Editor)**

jens-arne.subke@stir.ac.uk

Received and published: 21 March 2013

The peer-review of the manuscript has identified a significant flaw in the experimental design owing to the lack of replication for the contrasting sand dune types. The spatial extent of sampling indicated in the authors’ response of “1 to 2 m<sup>2</sup>” is insufficient to give confidence that the observed patterns are universal. I appreciate that significant efforts (and costs) were necessary to produce the presented results, but my view is that the study lacks the scientific rigour necessary for acceptance in Biogeosciences. I hope that the comments provided by referees (referee 3 in particular) are helpful, however.

Jens-Arne Subke (Editor)

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 10, 851, 2013.

**BGD**

10, C434–C435, 2013

---

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C435

