Interactive comment on “Benthic buffers and boosters of ocean acidification on coral reefs” by K. R. N. Anthony et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 15 March 2013

This is a thought provoking study that addresses important questions about how benthic communities alter the carbonate chemistry of the seawater such that they end up either offsetting or augmenting the effects of ocean acidification. I am really torn as to whether the manuscript is publishable or not in the present form. While the results are interesting and look reasonable the authors admit that the replication was extremely low (n=2 to 5) and as a result they have decided not to test whether the differences they report are significant. Therefore while they suggest they have found some interesting results it is not possible to say that they are significant or not. Since the experiments look easy to perform why not do the needed replication before attempting to publish? This finally is where I come down. The bar for publication should be set high.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 10, 1831, 2013.